

# MINUTES OF CRUDINE RIDGE WIND FARM COMMUNITY CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE (CCC)

### Thursday 4<sup>th</sup> May 2017 at Pyramul Hall, Pyramul

Attendees	Initials	Position
Owain Rowland-Jones Alan Heath Karen Croake Judy Rowland-Jones Vera Tomlinson Esme Martens Loretta Maclean Malcolm Healey Lisa Andrews Lisa Stiebel Mark Branson Cr Alex Karavas Ingrid Saywell	ORJ AH KC JRJ VT EsM LM MH LA LS MB AK IS	Community Representative Community Representative (Host) Community Representative (Host) Community Representative Community Representative Community Representative Bathurst Council Delegate Community Representative (Host) Independent Chairperson CWP Renewables – Community Engagement CWP Renewables – Development Manager Mid Western Regional Council Delegate Alternate for Max Price (Community Representative)
Apologies		
Max Price	MP	Community Representative
Observers Laureen Price Sue Lane Tim Rowland Jones	JP CP TRJ	Price Family Hundy Family Rowland-Jones Family
		Details and Actions
1.0 Welcome and Introductions  Meeting opened at 9:04am.  LA welcomed all present and introduced the new attendees.		<ul> <li>Cr Alex Karavas</li> <li>Lisa Stiebel</li> <li>Laureen Price</li> <li>Sue Lane; and</li> <li>Tim Rowland-Jones</li> </ul>
2.0 Apologies		Max Price – represented by Ingrid Saywell (alternate)
3.0 Declarations of Interest		LA declared that she was an Independent Chairperson, approved by the Department of Environment & Planning and engaged by CWP to chair the meeting.
4.0 Recording of Meeting		LA stated that she had received a request for the meeting to be recorded and informed the CCC that she had declined this request for the following reasons:  It is her standard business practice and common practice in the industry that community meetings are not recorded as it tends to stifle the open exchange of information between those present.

5.0 Code of Conduct & Pecuniary/Non- Pecuniary Forms	<ul> <li>Feedback often received on this subject is that people resist raising issues and contributing to the consultative process if they know that they are being recorded.</li> <li>It also might inhibit the information sharing from CWP.</li> <li>The CCC meeting is minuted with members also taking their own notes.</li> <li>The new guidelines will assist in the timely confirmation of minutes (this item moved to General Business for further briefing).</li> <li>LA advised the members that there are new forms that need to be completed as part of the new CCC guidelines for SSD. Forms were distributed for completion. LA requested that they be handed in at the end of the meeting, or if CCC members wished to take them home for further consideration, then scan or post to her asap.</li> </ul>
6.0 Confirmation of previous minutes	JRJ queried: Page 4, Item 7 (Answer) - Was: "There are six properties that have the right to request acquisition, which will include the house and any related parcels. This does not includes Max's property."  Discussions about this item by CCC with questions asked and answered by MB.  Proposed Amendment: "There are six properties that have the right to request acquisition, which will include the house and any adjoining lots."  Moved JRJ Seconded MH Accepted

5.0 Business arising			
	Item	Issue	Action By:
Action Items from previous minutes	1	LA to contact Julie Robinson from MWRC with details of the CCC.	LA (complete 27/5/16)
6.0 Correspondence	•	27/5/16 – Email from Julie Robertson Director Development at Mid Western Regional Council advising that Liz Densley had left Council and that future emails regarding the CCC should be sent to her.  3/8/16 - Advice to CCC members of the Public Exhibition of Wind Farm Guidelines  23/8/16 – Email from Ingrid Saywell seeking clarification about the buying up of farms.	
	•	24/8/16 - Email from chair to CCC membe Department of Planning's advice about the	•

- community information sessions to present on the draft Wind Energy Framework.
- 13/10/16 Email from MWRC advising that Councillor Alex Karavas as the Councillor Representative on the Crudine Ridge Wind Farm CCC. Check
- 11/4/17 Email to CCC members with a save the date for 4/5/17 and seeking availability of CCC members to attend.
- 15/4/17 Email from Esme Martens, advising that she had not received any emails from the Chair
- 15/4/17 Response back to EMe advising that the Chair was of understanding that she was the Mid Western Regional Council representative, however a check of the files confirms that she is on the CCC as a community representative. EM has been reinstated on the distribution list to receive all future emails.
- 19/4/17 Ingrid Saywell Request for observer status for Laureen Price
- 22/4/17 Owain Rowland-Jones Request for observer status for Tim Rowland-Jones and Sue Lane.
- 23/4/17 Email to CCC members seeking their consideration of the three requests for observer status
- 24/4/17 Email to CCC members that observer status had been granted to Laureen & Tim, however, Mrs Lane had been declined.
- 24/4/17 Emails to Ingrid & Owain with the same information and asking them to pass on the determination to all parties and remind them that observers will not be permitted to participate in the business of the meeting.
- Various emails backwards and forwards regarding this decision to third parties.
- 3/5/17 –Email to members, advising that following reconsideration Sue Lane has been granted observer status to represent the Hundy Family.

Moved: LA Seconded: AH

## 8.0 Project Update / Discussion

MB acknowledged it has been a year since last CCC meeting due to there being no news or project updates, however now that approvals have been granted it is CWP's intention to hold CCC meetings more regularly.

MB provided project update (see attached presentation) and responded to questions as follows:

IS asked whether both north and south sections of the wind farm will proceed. MB confirmed that both sections are likely to go ahead, although the final layout of the 37 turbines is yet to be determined.

EM asked whether with only 37 turbines approved the project remains viable. MB gave an update on technology advancements and MW capacity of the newer generators. MB confirmed that CWP intend to build the project as approved and that it will be proceeding.

IS raised vertical integration turbine technology, MB stated he was not aware of this being used at commercial or utility scale. IS will send details through to MB by email.

IS sought clarification on the 100m micro-siting and whether there were exemptions to this in relation to turbines not being moved closer to residences. MB confirmed that for certain residences turbines cannot be moved closer.

EM asked about the species of "small purple pea". MB provided an update, stating that a survey has been completed which identified "small purple pea" colonies along the transmission line corridor. A further study will be conducted during flowering season. MB reiterated the project's commitment to avoiding these colonies and in other areas, if discovered.

EM asked about the split of community benefit funds between Mid-Western Regional & Bathurst City Councils. MB confirmed that the funds comprise \$1,250 per MW installed capacity, approximately \$166k per annum however the split between council regions cannot be finalised until the final layout is confirmed.

JRJ requested a sample of copy of the affected landowner agreement including terms and conditions. MB responded that he will be in a position to share neighbour agreement documents with the relevant landowners once the final layout is confirmed.

JRJ raised the issue of noise monitoring and advised the meeting that some affected landowners are intending to have independent noise impact & property valuation assessments undertaken privately. ORJ & IS raised concerns that the previous noise report contained errors. MB stated that with the number of turbines being reduced from 77 to 37 that a revised landscape and visual impact assessment will be undertaken and a noise compliance report will be undertaken prior to construction. These documents are for internal purposes and are not required under the Development Consent. MB advised that the EPA will monitor noise once the project is in operation.

The topic of road upgrades was raised. MB informed the CCC that CWP are working closely at the moment with Mid-Western Regional Council on both Aarons Pass and Bombandi Roads

IS asked about the project's insurance policy and whether there is a decommissioning bond. MB stated that whilst the project has a comprehensive insurance policy a decommissioning bond was not required as part of the consent. MB will follow up to see if there is reference made to decommissioning in the insurance policy. [Subsequently MB confirmed that the Project's position regarding decommissioning has not changed since the Environmental Assessment was undertaken. All decommissioning costs remain the responsibility of the Project owner. Further information can be found in chapter 18 of the Environmental Assessment.]

MB provided an update on BioBanking, CWP will be purchasing 674h low intensity grazing pastoral land on Hill End Road, where an offset site will be established under the NSW BioBanking Scheme. CWP will own and manage the site which will be registered as a BioBank Site in perpetuity. AH enquired as to whether it is more extensive than Council's weed management protocols and processes, MB outlined that management of

the site will be regulated by the NSW Office of Environment and Heritage under the BioBanking Regulation. Management actions typically include fencing, feral animal control, weeding, tree planting, maintenance and rehabilitation to native vegetation including Box Gum Woodland

IS enquired about catch and release of animals. MB informed the meeting that the Biodiversity Management Plan and Environmental Management System are being developed and that there will be a pre-clearance survey by qualified ecologists to ensure clearance practices have minimal impact on wildlife. A local Mudgee consultant with Eco Logical Australia will be undertaking this work. NSW OEH will review plans according to their assessment criteria.

JRJ asked if this will include Aarons Pass Road and MB confirmed that it will.

MB informed the CCC about the timeline which is still being refined. There is no definitive start date yet however it is likely that construction will commence in Q3 /Q4 of 2017. The revised 37 turbine optimised layout is the immediate task.

EM enquired whether only 54 trees will be required to be removed along Aarons Pass Rd, MB stated that the Ecological Impact Assessment identified the area to be cleared for the Project in hectares, which was used when developing the biodiversity conditions in the Development Consent. ORJ emphasised the uniqueness of this road and asked whether the Downer-Rex layout was definitive and what recourse there would be if changes to Aarons Pass Rd are more extensive. MB acknowledged the importance of Aarons Pass Rd and that the project will be managing transport and roadworks to minimise impact. CWP are working with a specialist road engineer and haulage provider for wind farm projects to develop a detailed design for the council roads.

ORJ asked if members had seen the You Tube footage of turbine transport through Glen Innes.

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RhlYQVht7oM

ORJ stated concerns around the impact of flood rains on Aarons Pass Rd. MB agreed to take flood & heavy rain issues into CWP's discussions with MWRC.

KC stated that sections of Aarons Pass Rd are currently not wide enough and have poor visibility, leading to greater likelihood of accidents. KC asked about who maintains the road post construction. MB confirmed that it is a road upgrade project and as a council road it will be maintained by the Project during construction, and will return to Council for maintenance following construction.

IS enquired about rehabilitation of embankments along road corridor and type of vegetation that will be used. There has been a rumour relating to CWP offering wattle seed tube stock which MB clarified was not the case, species used in landscaping have not been defined an no formal neighbour agreement offers have been made. MB affirmed that the road

embankments will be stabilised and vegetation will be offset in line with the Biodiversity Management Plan.

KC asked whether council can make modifications. MB stated that consent stipulates that the road be upgraded to the satisfaction of Council. Loretta (BRC) indicated that councils have their own environmental approvals processes relating to road upgrades. Subsequent to the meeting, MB confirmed that in the case of the Project, the road upgrades are included in the State Significant Development Consent.

LS provided an update on CWP's community engagement approach for Sapphire Wind Farm which began construction in January 2017. This approach has three themes: the partnering with contractors to widen the resources and be able to deliver small scale infrastructure improvements, the development of a series of community legacy projects (which will differ depending on what needs or opportunities arise) and the possibility of community investment. The CCC were asked to start considering community projects that could be worked on collaboratively during the construction phase. IS suggested that Pyramul Hall upgrades could be considered.

ORJ & JRJ requested a visit to site pre-construction. MB said he was happy to try and facilitate; however the land is private land and consent from host landowners would need to be sought. CWP have no lease over the land until construction commences.

#### 9.0 General Business

#### **New CCC Guidelines for State Significant Developments:**

- LA provided a briefing on the new Community Consultative Committee Guidelines for State Significant Developments (November 2016) and also distributed the Code of Conduct and Pecuniary/Non-Pecuniary Interest forms for completion.
- The briefing provided a summary of the more significant changes:
  - The guidelines cover all SSD projects (mining, wind farms, solar, extractive industries, infrastructure, etc)
  - The committees can now be set up early in the assessment process
  - Improved governance; Code of Conduct & Pecuniary/Non-Pecuniary Interest Forms
  - o A pool of Independent Chairs will be recruited by DPE
  - o Review of the guidelines every 5 years.
  - Increase in community membership now up to 7.
  - Chair's to provide an annual report to DP&E for publishing on the website
  - o Change to draft minutes and finalising of minutes
  - o Observers chair's consult with CCC.

KC asked how the Voluntary Partner Agreements (VPA) with Councils are proceeding and how the community funds will be allocated. MB confirmed that for MWRC the funds will be allocated to the council's Community Plan. KC asked if there is a way to ensure that funds are channelled into the local community within the vicinity of the project.

EM provided an update on the Council's current consultation process of its Operational Plan, which ends in third week of May. The CCC agreed to send a letter to MWRC by this date requesting that consideration be given for allocating funds to the local community and in particular to the upgrade and ongoing upkeep of Pyramul Hall.

Motion from KC: That the CCC write to MRWC requesting that funding be provided for the upgrading of the Pyramul Hall.

All in favour.

IS asked a question from Max Price relating to renewable energy prices and the role of AEMO. MB provided a short briefing on AEMO spot market, the RET and energy prices.

IS enquired about visual screening, and whether larger trees can be relocated from clearance areas and who maintains the trees until they are well established. MB responded that it is unlikely that mature trees would be relocated because of the low success rate for translocations. Visual screening agreements are yet to be established and maintenance during establishment is an item to consider.

IS asked whether the two councils have visited other wind farms. MB was unable to comment.

IS asked about regularity of communication and meetings as the project moves forward. LA affirmed that the CCC meeting would become more regular, likely to be quarterly and that there will also be "1800" hotline number set up which will operate 24/7 prior to the commencement of construction.

JRJ asked whether CWP was still a partner with the Thai company, Wind Energy Holdings. MB said that this arrangement has not eventuated. MB reported that the financing and power purchase agreement (PPA) discussions for CRWF are progressing well and hopes to be able to provide an update at the next meeting.

JRJ asked whether CWP intended seeking a Statement of Reasons or appealing the Minister's approval. MB advised that CWP intend to construct the project in accordance with the PAC and Commonwealth approvals.

ORJ raised concerns about accountability and compliance and that the 2015 & 2016 versions of the CCC minutes on the project website need updating to final versions. ORJ noted that one of MB's requested changes relating to removal of some personal comments to last year's minutes weren't incorporated into the final version. LA reminded the CCC that the IC has final say over the content of the minutes and doesn't always accept comments or adjustments to the minutes, in this instance LA felt that the content conveyed the flavour of the discussion.

LA suggested she invite a compliance officer from DP&E to a future CCC meeting. (No objections raised.) MB informed the meeting that he has already facilitated a visit by NSW OEH Compliance team. A complaints

register will be established during construction, as required under the consent.

ORJ noted that the CCC guidelines require any detailed reports that CCC will be discussing to be distributed one week prior to meetings to allow members time to read and digest ahead of the meeting. LA commented that the project update for this meeting did not constitute a detailed report. MB agreed that if any detailed documents or reports are tabled for discussion they will be distributed one week in advance. Once Environmental Management, Biodiversity, Traffic Management Plans, etc are approved by DP&E; they will be provided.

LA reminded the CCC that all approved plans are available on the CRWF website.

MB informed the meeting that the various plans currently in development are likely to be with government departments in draft versions around mid-year. Local input into these documents is being provided through the sourcing of local expertise and consultants.

ORJ read out part of a letter from the Department's Secretary regarding the Liverpool Plains Wind Farm and asked MB about the cost per turbine of decommissioning and what happens if the owners become insolvent. (Refer to response from MB on Page 4).

ORJ raised concerns that all colonies of the "small purple pea" may not have been identified due to the long dormancy period of the species. MB reaffirmed that the site had been surveyed in the appropriate season, with colonies only identified on one property under the proposed transmission line and that this will be assessed again by ecologists during the flowering season. CWP will work with the ecologists to plan the detailed design to limit impacts to Box Gum Woodland.

#### 10.0 Next Meeting

The next meeting was set down for Tuesday 15<sup>th</sup> August at the Pyramul Hall, commencing at 9.30am

#### Meeting closed at 12:02pm.

#### LA thanked all present for their attendance.

#### **Action Items:**

Item	Issue	Action By:
1	Write to MWRC commenting on its Operational Plan & possible funding	LA
	for the upgrade of the Pyramul Hall	
2	Forward vertical integration turbine technology information to MB	IS
3	Insurance information about decommissioning of turbines (Note:	МВ
	provided in minutes prior to finalisation – see page: 4.)	